

Report on National Multi-Stakeholder Workshop on Value Chain (VC) Studies Experience Convergence

Supported by HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation

ལྷ་གཡེ་མཚན་ལུངས་འབྲེལ་མཐུན་ཞིབ་འཇུག་གི་ ཉམས་ལུངས་གཅིག་མཐུན་བཅོམ་ཞིན་ཀླུ་ཡོངས་འབྲེལ་ཡོད་ཡོངས་གྱི་ཞལ་འཛོམས།
National Multi-Stakeholder Workshop on Value Chain (VC) Studies Experience Convergence
(Organized by the Country Office, HELVETAS)
Venue: Jambayang Resort, Thimphu
Date: 15th December 2017



January 2018
Submitted to HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation, Country Office, Thimphu
By Dorji's Consultancy Services



National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Abbreviations

APIC	: Association for Promotion of Indigenous Crafts
BAFRA	: Bhutan Agriculture and Food Regulatory Authority
BAOWE	: Bhutanese Association of Women Entrepreneurs
BDBL	: Bhutan Development Bank Limited
BCCI	: Bhutan Chamber of Commerce and Industry
CDG	: Constitutional Development Grant
CoP	: Cost of Production
Coops	: Cooperatives
CSO	: Civil Society Organisation
DAMC	: Department of Agricultural Marketing and Cooperatives
DoA	: Department of Agriculture
DoL	: Department of Livestock
FCBL	: Food Corporation of Bhutan Limited
FG	: Farmers Group
FYP	: Five Year Plan
HHs	: Households
IFPP	: Integrated Fruit Processing Plant
Kgs	: Kilograms
KNC	: Khengrig Namsum Cooperative
LEC	: Livestock Extension Centre
MAP	: Medicinal and Aromatic Plants
MoEA	: Ministry of Economic Affairs
MIS	: Management of Information System
NPHC	: National Post Harvest Centre
NRCAN	: National Research Centre for Animal Nutrition
NDRC	: National Dairy Research Centre
NSC	: National Seed Centre
Nu.	: Ngultrums
NWFPs	: Non Wood Forest Products
PFMP	: Participatory Forest Management Project
PMU	: Project Management Unit
RDC	: Research and Development Centre
RDI	: Rural Development Initiative

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

RDTC	: Rural Development Training Centre
RGoB	: Royal Government of Bhutan
RLP	: Rural Livelihood Project
RLDC	: Regional Livestock Development Centre
RMA	: Rapid Market Appraisal
RNR	: Renewable Natural Resources
SFED	: Social Forest and Extension Division
SWOT	: Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats
SMEs	: Small and Medium Enterprises
TA	: Technical Assistance
ToR	: Terms of Reference
UNDP	: United Nations Development Program
VCD	: Value Chain Development
WFP	: World Food Program

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Table of contents

Abbreviations.....	2
Table of contents	4
Acknowledgment	5
Background	6
Methodology.....	6
Workshop proceedings.....	7
<i>Introduction to the workshop.....</i>	7
<i>Presentations and discussions 1. Milk and Pipla value chain study reports recommendations</i>	7
<i>Presentations and discussions 2. Cardamom, Ginger and Vegetables</i>	8
Workshop outcomes.....	8
Main Reference Documents	9
Annex 1. Compilation of RLP VC recommendations.....	10
Annex 2. List of value chain studies conducted by various agencies and projects	18
Annex 3. Workshop Programme.....	20
Annex 4. Terms of reference	21
Annex 4. List of Workshop Participants	24

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Acknowledgment

This report is the outcome of one-day workshop with the representatives from Ministry of Agriculture and Forests (DAMC, DoA, DoL, RLP), UNDP, CSOs (Tarayana, BAOWE) and MoEA (APIC).

Dorji's Consultancy Services would like to thank all the participants for the participation and contributions to the report through discussions and the VC reports of the studies shared during the workshop.

The firm would like to thank HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation and in particular Mr. SangayWangdi, Sr. Programme Officer, Rural Economy, for having confidence in the firm to facilitate the workshop.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Background

Rural Livelihood Project III (RLP III) during the completion phase and sought to consolidate and sustain earlier areas of support capitalizing on experiences from engagement in rural livelihood thus far. In particular, this phase emphasised on consolidation of rural development initiatives (RDIs) supported in earlier phases (facilitate market chain through market chain platforms, and capitalise on lessons and experiences as inputs into pro-poor (policy) interventions). The phased supported new viable RDIs targeting the poorest households. The project supported capacity building of farmer groups to manage RDIs as well as maintain infrastructures supported in the past phases. As in earlier phases, this phase committed to social inclusiveness (including gender).

The outcome 3 of the project focused to increase the income of farmers' groups / cooperatives and small and medium enterprises (SMEs) through facilitating multi-stakeholder market chain platforms with support from a qualified national technical advisor to coordinate and implement the value chain studies for five prioritized commodities (cardamom, ginger, milk, pipla and vegetables). However, due to unavailability of a resident technical advisor (TA), the selection committee (representing MoAF and HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation (hereafter referred as HELVETAS)) decided to field competent national consultants for the assignments. The consultancy assignments were advertised through local media (Kuensel) and online (MoAF website and HSI website) and the Value Chain (VC) assignments were awarded in 2 parts - a) agriculture VC studies for cardamom, ginger and vegetables, b) pipla and milk VC studies. Each commodity was given a duration of 15 working days that include planning, travelling, meeting, debriefing and report writing.

To draw a meaningful conclusion to the various value chain assignments, HELVETAS wished to share and consolidate the experiences on VC Studies conducted through HELVETAS support and other donors supports through a National Multi-Stakeholder Workshop among Development Partners, Government and Non-governmental agencies.

The National Multi-Stakeholder Workshop on Value Chain studies was held on 15th December 2017 to share experiences on value chain studies and the reports supported by HELVETAS and other donors and document the convergence and differences of experiences among Development Partners, Government and non-government agencies. The following are compilation of the outcomes of this workshop.

Methodology

The Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officer from RLP presented the summary of recommendations of five VC studies (dairy, pipla, cardamom, ginger and vegetables) conducted in the RLP supported dzongkhags and gewogs of Sarpang and Zhemgang during 2017. The summary of recommendations is annexed (Annex 1).

Plenary discussions were held after first presentations of dairy and pipla VCs and after cardamom, and vegetable VCs.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

The participating organisations shared their experiences on VC studies both through presentation and discussions. UNDP shared the reports on Potato, Maize, Cardamom, Ginger and Dairy VCs, BAOWE on dairy, rice and vegetables, DoA on potato and DoL on honey.

The plenary discussions dwelled on the following issues:

- How can the VC recommendations be mainstreamed into the 12thFYP?
- What are the likely pipeline projects that can include furthering the recommendations or gaps in the VC studies?
- What are similar studies carried out by different projects, programs and partners?
- A format and platform for making the VC studies accessible to users

Workshop Proceedings

Introduction to the workshop

The Senior Programme Officer, Rural Economy of HELVETAS informed the workshop that RLP III was a shift from earlier support to production oriented intervention to market oriented intervention. As a result, series of value chain studies were supported (five through RLP and three through PFMP).

HELVETAS support to the theme Rural Economy in Bhutan will end by June 2018. Therefore, the workshop intends to consolidate and document the study results (findings and recommendations) of value chains supported by HELVETAS and other agencies so that these can be used by relevant organisations/projects for future planning and implementation. HELVETAS intends to hand over the study documents (list of value chain studies reports, findings and recommendations and value chain reports) to relevant focal government agencies for easy accessing by other agencies that may engage in value chain studies for their interventions.

Presentations and discussions 1. Milk and Pipla value chain study reports recommendations

Value chain analysis must make clear differentiation from supply and focus on market demand analysis and recommend strategies to link the commodities to the market. Recommendations must identify lead agencies for follow up- actions.

Value chain studies must review sufficient literature available to provide in-depth analysis of the situation to draw relevant conclusions and appropriate recommendations.

For high risks inputs (cow supply) high investment interventions (post-harvest processing equipment) recommendations to address policy issues (such as subsidies, priority sector lending, insurance, breeding programme, establishment of endowment fund etc.) are essential.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Presentations and discussions 2. Cardamom, Ginger and Vegetables

Many agencies are undertaking similar studies thus duplicating the efforts and complicating value chain approaches and confusing the value chain actors. Many chain study recommendations should enhance collaboration (farmers groups and cooperatives) rather than competition among the value chain actors.

Simple apps and technologies can be used to connect the value chain actors to create transparency in the business, which are essential for value chains to function properly.

Value chain studies should explore the potential for preservation and prolonging of vegetables seasons to maintain steady supply and profitable engagement of the value chain actors.

In the absence of well-established value chains often single actor performs all the value chain functions over burdening the actor and reducing the efficiency of the chains. At present the main value chain actors are the small farmers who lack knowledge and experiences to engage in the value chains and this makes value chain establishment and management difficult.

The main user (DoA) of the value chain approaches to market development and supporters (DAMC, PPD and UNDP) of value chain approaches agreed to the usefulness of the value chain studies conducted by RLP through HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation. The stakeholders workshop was acknowledged as most appropriate forum to share the experiences and agreed to document the experiences and value chain studies conducted by various agencies as one of the outcomes of this workshop.

Workshop Outcomes

The workshop shared a list of 19 (Annex 2) value chains carried out so far by various projects, agencies and organisations and four (cardamom, potato, apple and ginger) more value study reports will soon be published.

BAOWE has plans to conduct value chain studies for MAP, cardamom, vegetable, rice and dairy soon.

(Attention: All Concerned)

The workshop agreed that results of the value chain studies will be useful to coordinate the value chain studies in 12th five year plan (FYP) and beyond.

(Attention: PPD, MoAF)

The recommendations will be used to develop strategies to implement value chains in the 12th FYP to contribute to RNR marketing/value chain development enhancement to be led by DAMC for MoAF.

(Action: DAMC, MoAF)

The workshop agreed on the need to develop knowledge management system for value chain studies for access to the information on value chains like commodities on which values chain studies are conducted, methodologies used, and lessons learnt.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

DAMC agreed to initially host the various value chain studies on their website and UNDP supported Global Environment Facility-Least Developed Countries Fund (GEF-LDCF) project will provide link to the DAMC website to share the knowledge and experiences and provide guidance for future value chain studies.

(Action: DAMC, MoAF & UNDP)

The facilitating consultant will establish a list of value chain studies conducted so far by various agencies and projects. The consultant will also compile and provide soft copies of value chain study reports conducted so far to HELVETAS to be handed to DAMC for knowledge management on value chain studies.

(Action: Mr. Chhimi Dorji, Facilitator)

Main Reference Documents

1. Project Document. RLP Phase III.
2. Value Chain Reports (Vegetable, Milk, Ginger, Cardamom, Pipla) 2017. Rural Livelihood Project.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Annex 1. Compilation of RLP VC recommendations

1. Pipla

A. Short term recommended interventions

1. The Department of Forests and Park Services is recommended to issue instructions to the Field Divisions according approval for collection of Pipla since the DoFPS had approved the NWFPs management plan.

2. After the FCB discontinued buying and auctioning of the Pipla since 2003, information on volume traded, prices fetched and profit margins earned were all distorted. No proper records were available with either local Government or RNR staff. Therefore, the SFED, DoFPS is suggested to play the lead role in maintaining proper information on volumes collected, sold, gender wise collectors and extend of households. The SFED is suggested to develop simple database to gather these information. The information generated with this database will enable the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Helvetas Swiss Intercooperation (HSI) to evaluate extent of economic impacts that had brought to the people through engagement in Pipla in ZhemgangDzongkhag.

3. The *Tshogpas*/groups and the traders are recommended to avail services of DAMC and SFED for effective marketing and other related services.

4. The documentations on NWFPs are available but the physical properties are not correlated with the extent of markets available and value that can fetch. Therefore, the SFED may conduct separate studies on the ethno properties and extent of markets and market value.

5. The current Royalty rate for sale of Pipla is charged Nu. 20.00/kg. Royalty rate seems to be high compared to the price at the markets. Therefore, the royalty rate may be reviewed commensurate to its prevailing market price.

6. In the initial stage, the groups are constrained with finances to kick-start operation of the groups. In the initial stage, cooperative needs to invest on different sectors like visit, meeting, infrastructure development and purchase of transport. The concerned agencies are recommended to provide seed money. Alternatively, the SFED is suggested to facilitate to obtain soft loan from the financial institutions. In the event soft loans are not obtained from the financial institutions, Constitutional Development Grant (CDG) should be utilized fully as henceforth authority to disburse CDG lies with the RNR sector. CDG grant sanctioned by the Government to a tune of Nu.2.00 million is an effective financial instrument to create spread out effect (impact) to the rural farmers as more poor farmers are engaged in dairy, livestock and agricultural activities.

7. The DAMC and SFED of the MoAF are recommended to identify one marketing officer solely to assist the NWFPs management groups to market their products.

8. There was administrative and management weakness among the *Tshogpas*. Some members were members just to fill the members' list. No regular meetings were held. Portfolio holders

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

were busy in their private affairs than to the group. Therefore, PMU and SFED are recommended to take measures to affirm to their by-laws and rules.

B. Medium term recommended interventions

9. Most of the Pipla groups were formed and many groups had not operated. Tshaidang, Goling, Shobleng and SonamthangShingminTshogpas had not fully operated. These groups had sold Pipla but had not maintained proper records. As such, it is difficult to obtain information on volumes of Pipla collected, marketed and revenues earned. The relevant agency, the Rural Development Training Centre (RDTC), Zhemgang is recommended to impart trainings on record keeping and other basic management. Other than drying and sorting, no value additions are found. Hence, there is a need to capacitate Pipla groups for processing, product development, value addition, branding and export of NWFPs.

10. In the past, the FCB conducted auction of Pipla on behalf of the traders for good intended purposes. It was later discontinued for the reasons that the FCB had not been able to obtain fair price. In addition to commission deducted by FCB the DoFPS also levied royalty charges. Both royalty and commission charges had resulted in lowering net profits to the collectors. Other reasons could be the drop in prices in Indian and international markets. Since 2015, the DoFPS had conducted the auction system on behalf of the NWFP groups. This practice is healthy and is recommended to continue. This system was found under the NWFP groups under Nganglam Dungkhag of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag but had not been practised under ZhemgangDzongkhag.

11. The groups' marketing committee should be trained to conduct marketing on their own. The marketing committee should link themselves to the traders and middlemen to finally deliver the consignments to the end markets. Alternatively, they can play roles of traders to transact business to reduce the number of actors in the chain, thereby increasing net profits to the collectors and the groups. There is a need to train the marketing committee to explore better markets through market information system (MIS) dissemination. The present Community Information Centre (CIC) established in each Gewog centre should be effectively used for exploring markets. The RDTC is recommended to play the lead role in these areas.

12. More groups were formed without strong support from the RLP II, Zhemgang and other central concerned agencies. One or two groups should have been formed on a pilot basis with full support in terms of finance, infrastructures and capacity building. Once pilot groups are made successful, new groups should be formed; experiences gained should have been replicated. At present, several groups were formed for name sake of groups without any tangible outcomes on the ground. The central agency is recommended to review current Pipla groups.

C. Long term recommended interventions

13. Export to third country like Bangladesh, the provisions of the bilateral agreement should be revisited. Pipla and other NWFPs should be covered in the list of items to be exported to the third countries to exempt products from duties of inbound country. Currently, it is apparent that Pipla and other NWFPs are not included under bilateral agreements. Hence, there is an urgent need to renew the agreement. The focal persons in SFED and DAMC should play active roles to

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

explore distant end markets to gain maximum profits to the rural farmers. If the distant markets are captured, objectives of the HSI and the Government will not be achieved. By the past experiences since 1960s, Pipla production and marketing have not progressed remarkably as the traders had continued to transact business in neighbouring Indian towns. The focal persons should make linkages between various central institutions, NWFP groups for better coordination for effective marketing. The focal offices should keep budget provisions for exploration of markets in India and third countries.

14. In the event distant overseas markets are obtained, Pipla alone may not be sufficient to fulfil demand. Therefore, to increase economies of scale, other NWFPs are recommended for collection and business.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

2. Dairy

Medium to long Term recommendations

Value Chain Functions	Recommendation	Actors	Lead Agency
1. Hygienic production including improved dairy management practices and Feed and Fodder development Post-harvest and transportation	Support and enhance the overall farm economic competencies of the dairy farmers a) by upgrading the progenies of existing low yielding cows through AI or breeding bulls. b) Possibility of leasing govt land for improved pasture development c) Promotion of small scale feed mixing plant using locally available ingredients.	Farmers Livestock Extension Agents and DLO. Farmer groups/ cooperatives, DoL	NDRC, Concern Dzongkhag, NRCAN NDRC/RLDC
	Promote cold chain facility, cold storage at strategic locations and facilitate refrigerated van		
2. Processing, Storage and Marketing	Capacity building of existing MPU with additional equipment/plant for product diversification like pasteurized packaged whole milk, ice cream, milk based sweets, yoghurt etc.	RLP, DLO, LEC, NDRC Farmers Group	NDRC/DAMC

Short-term recommendations

3. Hygienic production including improved dairy management practices and feed and fodder development	Make high yielding breeds of cows available to interested members of the group. Train and educate farmers on hygienic production practices. Encourage farmers to Preserve fodder for lean season by adopting hay, silage making technologies. Reinvigorate the weak and non-functional group and revisit the ToR	Farmers Livestock Extension Agents RLDC and DLO. DAMC/Dzongkhag	NDRC/DoL NRCAN
4. Post-harvest and Transportation Processing, storage and marketing	Standard sized products packed using suitable and hygienic packaging materials Chillers and cold chain facilities like cool boxes.	Farmer groups /cooperatives, DoL RLP, DLO, RLDC, LEC, Farmers groups	BAFRA, DAMC Dzongkhag
5. Insurance	Animal insurance scheme	Farmers, DoL, RICBL/BIL	DoL

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

3. Cardamom

Immediate (1 to 2 years)

1. Facilitate meetings with growers, middlemen, traders and exporters to define quality and quality requirements of cardamom of the consumers, demand and prices based on the quality criteria agreed.
2. Create awareness on operational costs, risks and profit for each value chain actor.
3. Educate growers, middlemen and traders on the benefits of respecting the commitments to each other and quality requirements of the consumers.
4. Train the growers on the processing of cardamom (drying, grading, packing and storage) to improve the quality and price of cardamom.
5. Encourage and facilitate village vendors/middlemen for easy selling by the growers, bulking by the vendors to increase economy of scale to reduce operational cost (storage and transport), quality control and price regulation.
6. Create awareness on value chain and benefits of value chain among growers, middlemen, traders and exporters.
7. Explore potential for farmers' groups (FGs) and cooperatives (Coops) for cardamom marketing.

Intermediate (3 to 5 years)

8. Facilitate farmers' groups and cooperatives for cardamom marketing through awareness on benefits of working together, capacity building to manage FGs and Coops.
9. Facilitate link between farmers' groups, cooperatives and Indian traders and Bhutanese exporters.
10. Explore domestic market potential and product development for domestic and export markets.
11. Facilitate exporters to explore third country markets (Middle East and Europe) to break Indian monopoly.
12. Explore possibilities for organic certification

Long term (beyond 5 years)

13. Establish database to determine production and supply of cardamom.
14. Promote plantation of different ages to maintain annual production of cardamom to meet the market demand through education and advisory services.
15. Identify locations, growers and monitor the quality and quantity of growers to meet the local demands for seedlings.
16. Support research and development to develop suitable varieties and production technology for different agro-ecological zones.
17. Certify cardamom as organic cardamom product from Bhutan.
18. Institute an agency (for example Cardamom Board or Cardamom Association) to provide holistic and strategic policies and interventions to support cardamom industry in Bhutan.

4. Ginger

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Immediate interventions

Improve the existing ginger market

1. Educate the growers on the need of establishing trust and confidence with traders and buyers on the need to meet the quality standards of the market requirements.
2. Facilitate meetings with growers, traders and retailers to discuss supply, demand, quality standards and prices to build the confidence of the value chain actors to establish value chains.
3. Educate the growers on benefits of good post-harvest practices like grading, cleaning, curing and appropriate packing through meeting and discussions with Indian traders, visits to auction yards and vegetable markets.
4. Train farmers on grading, cleaning, curing methods and appropriate packing to reduce post-harvest losses in terms of quantity and quality during transit and storage.
5. Facilitate supply of ginger rhizome types that have demand in the market. For example ginger types from Chuzagang and Umling can be supplied to other ginger growers who intend to sell to India traders and Tsirang type to those who intend to sell in the Bhutanese market.
6. Encourage farmers' groups for bulking to improve economy of scale, to share transport cost, to add value through grading, cleaning, curing and packing and assure quality of ginger of the group.
7. Facilitate KNC to improve and diversify the products through product development, promotion and feed backs.
8. Engage with Bhutan Exporters Association to explore and support ginger export beyond India through a legal and a systematic approach.

Medium term interventions

9. Identify ginger types/varieties that are used to process into different ginger products. For example varieties required for fresh consumption, powder making, candy making, pickle ingredients, dry ginger.
10. Build up seed stock of different types/varieties and identify farmers and farmers' group to produce and supply the seed.
11. Explore markets for different types of ginger products with focus to export (third countries for example Middle East and Europe. These are major end markets for ginger from India) them considering demand, quality and standards and process.
12. Develop products and promote them by partnering with the retailers in the markets.
13. Explore potential entrepreneurs with interest and motivation to engage in production and marketing of ginger products. Or support cooperatives to engage in production and marketing of ginger and ginger products.
14. Explore benefits and potential for organic certification

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Long term interventions

15. Invest in research (NPHC) to develop products to diversify the products, to improve the productions and to expand the markets.
16. Invest in research (RDCs) to develop ginger types/varieties suited for different uses and products and production technologies to improve the production.
17. Obtain organic certificate for ginger and ginger products
- 18.** Institute an agency to oversee overall ginger and ginger product development for the country similar to Spices Board in India for example Ginger Board of Bhutan.

5. Vegetables

1. Organise annual stakeholder (value chain actors) meetings to discuss market demand, prices, quality, varieties of vegetables to create transparency and build trust and confidence among the value chain actors.
 2. Build the credibility of KNC as trustworthy leader in the value chain
 - a. Provide training on vegetable supply management to ensure the clients are delivered the right quantity and quality at the agreed price at the right time and place. At the same time ensure that the growers are paid the agreed price at the agreed time and place.
 - b. Provide training on post-harvest requirement, improve packaging and transportation to maintain the quality of vegetables and prolong the shelf-life to reduce the post-harvest losses and increase the profitability of the business.
 3. Support KNC to establish collection sheds with basic facility to weigh and protect the vegetables from sun and rain. Weighing in front of the growers will create transparency and trust between the KNC and the growers. The collection shed will help maintained the quality and prolong shelf-life of vegetables.
 4. Explore other farmers' groups and cooperatives and support them with capacity building to participate in the vegetable value chain.
 5. Build capacity of Extension Officers for holistic planning, technical backstopping and monitoring of the production by the growers. For example production planning based on agro-ecological zones to produce to meet weekly/monthly/annual demands of the market, planning grower numbers and groups and areas to produce required quantity and quality of vegetables.
 6. Build capacities of growers to participate in the value chain.
 - a. Create awareness on the importance of meeting the commitments in the value chain.
 - b. Create awareness on the quality requirements of vegetables by the consumers
-

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

- c. Provide training on the production practices
 - d. Provide training on post-harvest practices like sorting, cleaning, packaging and transporting.
 - e. Support traders, transporters and vendors through proper packaging on the post-harvest requirement and handling of vegetables.
 - f. Facilitate experience sharing among the growers through farmers' field schools
7. Train traders, transporters and vendors on the post-harvest requirement and handling of vegetables to reduce post-harvest losses and prolong shelf-life of vegetables.
 8. In the initial phases, regular monitoring and training of producers by the extension officers will be crucial to ensure that required vegetables in required quantities are produced by the growers. Bimonthly monitoring visits by the extension officers to see the progress of the vegetable and onsite training of growers are recommended.
 9. Mixed and integrated production of vegetables by larger number of growers is recommended to start with. This has will reduce the risk of crop failure by some growers and failure to meet the demand of the market since not all the growers will be affected. This also will reduce risk to growers should one crop fail due unforeseen conditions (weather, pests and diseases, seed failure).
 10. Conduct market research to assess market requirements of vegetables in terms of types, varieties, quality, demands and prices to feed back to the production and supply of vegetables.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Annex 2. List of value chain studies conducted by various agencies and projects

2006

1. Mahesh Ghimiray, Kencho Wangdi, Ganesh B Chettri, Louis Bockel and Meeta Punjabi, 2006. Commodity Chain Analysis: Rice

2007

2. MoA& FNPP, 2007. Commodity Chain Analysis: Maize
3. MoA& FNPP, 2007. Commodity Chain Analysis: Citrus

2008

4. MoA& FNPP, 2008. Commodity Chain Analysis: Apple
5. MoA& FNPP, 2008. Commodity Chain Analysis: Mushroom
6. MoA& FNPP, 2008. Commodity Chain Analysis: Mustard

2009

7. Joshi, S.R. and Gurung, B.R., 2009. Potato in Bhutan - Value Chain Analysis
8. Joshi, S.R. and Gurung, B.R., 2009. Citrus in Bhutan - Value Chain Analysis
9. Joshi, S.R. and Gurung, B.R., 2009. Value Chain Analysis of Dairy in Merak and Sakteng.
10. Bhim Raj Gurung, RAMCO, and Sichan Shrestha, SNV. September 2010. Study on Off-Season Vegetables for Target Markets

2011

11. Practical Solutions Consulting Firm, 2011. Market Study of Selected Vegetables in Assam and SamdrupJongkhar Wholesale Markets.
12. RAMCO. 2014. Review Report – School Linking Program under VVCP-E
13. Meeta Punjabi Mehta, Jimba Rabgyal, Sagar Acharya, 2015. Commodity Chain Analysis of Ginger in Bhutan.
14. Dr Nar B Tamang and Kabi Raj Gurung, 2015. Honey Value Chain Study in Bhutan

2016

15. Dorji's Consultancy Services, 2016. Timber value chain and business plan for Yarkey Community Forest Management Group, PatshalingGewog, Tsirang. HSI
16. UNDP Bhutan, 2016. Value Chain and Market Analysis of Renewable Natural Resources Products (Potato, Maize, Cardamom, Ginger and Dairy) Report
17. Dawa L Sherpa, Deo Kumar Gurung, Ganga Ram Rai&Basant Sharma, 2016. Livestock Commodity Value Chains in Western Bhutan. RLDC Tsimasham, Chukha

2017

18. Dorji's Consultancy Services, 2017. Ginger value chain Analysis and Facilitation for Sarpang and Zhemgang for Rural Livelihood Project III. HSI.
19. Dorji's Consultancy Services, 2017. Cardamom value chain Analysis and Facilitation for Sarpang and Zhemgang for Rural Livelihood Project III. HSI.
20. Dorji's Consultancy Services, 2017. Vegetable value chain Analysis and Facilitation for Sarpang and Zhemgang for Rural Livelihood Project III. HSI.
21. Dr. DR Neopani, 2017. Milk Production & value chain in Sarpang and Zhemgang Dzongkhags. HSI.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

22. Rinchen Consultancy Services, 2017. Pipla Production & value chain in Sarpang and Zhemgang Dzongkhags. HSI
23. Karma Tshering, Apa Consults, 2017. Market study on Cane and Bamboo Products. HSI.
24. Himalayan Engineering and Management Consultancy, 2017. Dairy Value Chain – Rapid Assessment Report.
25. Himalayan Engineering and Management Consultancy, 2017. Vegetable Value Chain – Rapid Assessment Report.
26. Sanjay Kumar Gupta, 2017. Dairy Value Chain Analysis Report. Read Global. ADB
27. Sanjay Kumar Gupta, 2017. Vegetables and Rice Value Chain Analysis Report. Read Global. ADB

Yet to be published by Department of Agriculture, MoAF.

28. Cardamom
29. Potato
30. Apples
31. Ginger

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Annex 3. Workshop Programme

Time	Programme	Responsibility
09:00	Registration of participants	HELVETAS
09:15	Introduction of the Workshop	HELVETAS
09:25	Introduction of the participants	Facilitator
09:35	Presentation of VC studies, recommendations and status of follow up actions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Milk (15mins) • Pipla and (15 mins) Brief discussion and comments (10mins)	PMU-RLP
10:15	Coffee/tea Break	
10:30	Presentation of VC studies, recommendations and status of follow up actions continued <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vegetables (15mins) • Cardamom (15mins) • Ginger (15mins) Brief discussion and comments (15 mins)	PMU-RLP
11:30	General Discussions moderated by the facilitator on VC undertaken by the RLP (30mins)	Facilitator
12:30	Remarks by HELVETAS (10 mins)	
12:30 - 13:30	Lunch Break	
13:30	Experience sharing by partners and CSOs on similar studies and their follow up actions (10 mins per agency) [sharing of reports by individual agencies during tea/lunch (individual stalls)]	Facilitator
15:00	Coffee break	
15:15	Discussion on coordination of follow up actions and compilation of similar studies	Facilitator
16:30	Plenary and wrap up	Facilitator

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Annex 4. Terms of Reference

1. **Job Title:** National Consultant (Short term)
2. **Task:** Design, facilitate and document a National Multi-Stakeholder Workshop on Value Chain (VC) Studies Experience Convergence among Development Partners and Government agencies
3. **Agency:** Rural Livelihood Project Phase III, Zhemgang

Background

RLP III is the completion phase and seeks to consolidate and sustain earlier areas of support capitalizing on experiences from engagement in rural livelihood so far. In particular, this phase will consolidate rural development initiatives (RDIs) supported in earlier phases, facilitate market chain through market chain platforms, and capitalise on lessons and experiences as inputs into pro-poor (policy) interventions. Specific viable new RDIs will be supported, targeting the poorest households. The project will build the capacity of farmer groups to manage RDIs as well as maintain infrastructures supported in the past phases. As in earlier phases, it is committed to social inclusiveness (including gender).

Under outcome 3, the project seeks to increase the income of farmers' groups / cooperatives and small and medium enterprises (SMEs) through facilitating multi-stakeholder market chain platforms. Though the project planned on recruiting a qualified national technical advisor to coordinate and implement the value chain studies for five prioritized commodities (cardamom, ginger, milk, pipla and vegetables) there were no takers for the post. Due to unavailability of a resident TA, the selection committee (representing MoAF and HELVETAS) decided to field competent national consultants for the assignments. The consultancy assignments were advertised through local media (Kuensel) and online (MoAF website and HELVETAS website). Substantial time (4 months) was lost in processing the formalities for the selection of competent consultants. Only by October 2016 could the consultants be assigned for the tasks.

The VC assignments were divided into 2 parts - a) agriculture VC studies for cardamom, ginger and vegetables, b) pipla and milk VC studies. Each commodity was given a duration of 15 days that include planning, travelling, meeting, debriefing and report writing.

Scope of the work

- a) Review and finalize the workshop methodology in collaboration with Sr. PO, HELVETAS,
- b) Facilitate the 1-day VC experience sharing workshop,
- c) Document the proceedings of the workshop,
- d) And list other VC studies not covered during the workshop as part of the final report/document.

Required Competencies

Academic Qualifications:

- At least a university degree in the relevant field with experience working in the RNR sector.
- Fluency in both written and spoken English language

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Technical Competencies and Experience Requirements

- At least 10 years of working experience and good knowledge in VC of local products/crops including experience facilitating national/regional level workshops.
- A proven record of working on a similar tasks and writing reports in English.

Prerequisites

- A plan of work schedule will be a must for the HELVETAS to agree and work together.
- The full amount of professional fees (less tax) will be paid only after the satisfactory delivery of the workshop proceedings/report; 30% of the professional fee shall be paid on signing of the contract.
- As the workshop is scheduled in Thimphu, no logistics and travel related to the consultancy (lodge, food & transportation) is foreseen. Working lunch and refreshments will be provided for the 1-day workshop by HELVETAS.
- Consultant will be assisted by the Sr. PO in organizing of workshop as necessary.

Indicative Timeline

Date	Program	Remarks
12-14 Dec 2017	Planning, designing and preparation for the workshop	
15 (Fri) Dec 2017	VC Experience Sharing Workshop	Venue: Jambayang Resort
18-25 Dec 2017	Finalization & Submission of report to HELVETAS	

Tentative Workshop Programme

09:00 Registration of participants

09:15 Introduction of the Workshop by HELVETAS/PPD

09:25 Introduction of the participants by facilitator

09:35 Presentation of VC studies, recommendations and status of follow up actions

- Cardamom (15")
- Ginger (15")
- Brief discussion and comments (10")

10:15 Coffee/tea Break

10:30 Presentation of VC studies, recommendations and status of follow up actions continued

- Vegetables (15")
- Pipla and (15 ")
- Milk (15")
- Brief discussion and comments (15")

11:30 General Discussions moderated by the facilitator on VC undertaken by the RLP (30")

12:30 Remarks by HELVETAS (10")

12:30 - 13:30 Lunch Break

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

13:30 Presentation by partners and CSOs on similar studies and their follow up actions

14:30 Discussion on coordination of follow up actions and compilation of similar studies

Main issues for deliberations

The facilitator proposes to confine to the discussion on the following;

- How can the VC recommendations be mainstreamed into the 12thFYP
- What are the likely pipeline projects that can include furthering the recommendations or gaps in the VC studies?
- What are similar studies carried out by different projects, programs and partners?
- A format and platform for making the VC studies accessible to users

Expected outcomes

Based on the agreed format for compilation, document a set of all similar VC studies done in the recent past;

- Set of files and folders containing all VC studies by subject, author and date
- Compile findings and recommendations from each VC study (a short word document with recommendations, basis of recommendations and reference to each study)
- Compile and document proceedings of the workshop Document.

Reference Documents

- Project Document. RLP Phase III.
- Value Chain Reports (Vegetable, Milk, Ginger, Cardamom, Pipla) 2017. Rural Livelihood Project.

National Multi-Stakeholder Value Chain Experience Sharing Report

Annex 4. List of Workshop Participants

Sl. No.	Name	Designation	Agency	Mobile No.	Email address
1	Bhim Raj Gurung	Marketing Specialist	DAMC	17605950	brgurung@moaf.gov.bt
2	Sonam Tshomo	Marketing Officer	DAMC	17624076	sonamtshomo@moaf.gov.bt
3	Dr. M.P Timsina	Specialist	DoL	17718099	mptimsina@moaf.gov.bt
4	Tshewang Lham	Asst. MO	DAMC	77818510	tlhamo@moaf.gov.bt
5	Tshetrim Dorji	Communication Officer	APIC/MoEA	17545845	Tshetrim@apic.org.bt
6	Rinzin Dorji	PO	PPD/MoAF	17879843	rdorji@moaf.gov.bt
7	Dawa Dakpa	Offtg. Project Manager	RLP, Zhemgang	17447684	rlp.rnne@gmail.com
8	Ugyen Lhendup	Asst. Program Officer	RLP, Zhemgang	17761485	ugendup@gmail.com
9	Pema Loday	QM/Adm	APIC/MoEA	17608635	Pemaloday83@gmail.com
10	Bishnu Chettri	UNDP Intern	UNDP	17447788	Bichettri321@gmail.com
11	Jimba Rabgyal	DoA, HO	DoA	17966638	jrabgyal@moaf.gov.bt
12	Tshering Wangmo	Project Coordinator	BAOWE	17853585	Tsheringwangmo@baowe.org
13	Tshering Pelden	Project Coordinator	BAOWE	17640383	baowe.bhutan@gmail.com
14	Yangchen Lhamo	Project Coordinator	BAOWE	17505267	baowe.bhutan@gmail.com
15	Sangay Choden	Dy CMO	DAMC	17629914	sangaychoden@moaf.gov.bt
16	Lokey Thapa	Sr. LPO	NDRC, Yusipang	17614398	lthapa@moaf.gov.bt
17	Deki Choden	Sr. LPO	NDRC, Yusipang	17795688	dekic@moaf.gov.bt
18	Dr N.B. Tamang	PD/Specialist	NDRC, Yusipang	17866132	nbtamang@moaf.gov.bt
19	Dechen Dorji	Research Asst.	Tarayana Foundation	17845406	ailadambo@gmail.com
20	Tshering Penjor	PTS	UNDP	17991899	tsheringpenjor@undp.org
21	Dr. Yadunath Bajgai	PRO/NPC	RDC, Yusipang	17804305	ybajgai@moaf.gov.bt
22	Chhimi Dorji	Facilitator	DCS	17671676	Chhimidorji123@gmail.com
23	Sangay Wangdi	Sr. Programme Officer	HELVETAS	17631860	Sangay.Wangdi@helvetas.org

Published by **HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation Bhutan**
Dungkar Lam, Lower Motithang

Phone: +975 2 32 28 70 Fax +975 2 32 32 10
E-mail: helvetas@druknet.bt
www.bhutan.helvetas.org

